Shallow and deep crustal control on differentiation of calc-alkaline and tholeiitic magma

John M. Hora a,*, Brad S. Singer a, Gerhard Wörner b, Brian L. Beard a, Brian R. Jicha a, Clark M. Johnson a

a Department of Geoscience, University of Wisconsin–Madison, 1215 W. Dayton Street, Madison, WI 53706, USA
b Geowissenschaftliches Zentrum der Universität Göttingen, Abteilung Geochemie, Goldschmidtstr. 1, 37077 Göttingen, Germany

A R T I C L E   I N F O

Article history:
Received 10 December 2008
Received in revised form 26 May 2009
Accepted 27 May 2009
Available online 4 July 2009

Editor: R.W. Carlson

Keywords:
Parinacota
Andes
238U-230Th isotopes
87Sr/86Sr
lower crust
assimilation

1. Introduction

Continental crust that overlies subduction zones filters magmas according to their density, and in most cases, passage through it modifies melt chemical and isotopic compositions. Evidence of magma–crust interaction has long been recognized in many arcs, and where crustal thickness varies along strike, the intensity of chemical modification co-varies with thickness (Leeman, 1983; Hildreth and Mooibarth, 1988; Tormey et al., 1991). Where crust is heterogeneous, individual domains impart their isotopic fingerprints on transient magmas (Wörner et al., 1992; Kersting et al., 1996; Mamani et al., 2008). Stagnation that results in chemical modification may occur at two broadly defined locations: the base of the crust (Hildreth and Mooibarth, 1988; Annen et al., 2006), and at shallow levels in plumbing systems that feed individual volcanoes. Here, we aim to discriminate the effects of shallow and deep assimilation and show how their relative importance varies over time.

Continental arcs challenge simple models for magmatic evolution because magmas with significant compositional, density, and rheological variability are commonly juxtaposed in such settings and it remains unclear why some magmas are filtered by the crust and others are not. Several models propose mechanisms whereby high-Fe (tholeiitic) vs. low-Fe (calc-alkaline) trends arise (Miyashiro, 1974; Arculus, 2003). Coulon and Thorpe (1981) and Leeman (1983) observed that the proportion of calc-alkaline magmas increases with crustal thickness. Experimental evaluation of closed-system thermodynamic controls on differentiation showed that calc-alkaline differentiation at low pressure (Grove and Baker, 1984; Grove and Kinzler, 1986). Assimilation of eutectic melts is an alternate, open-system mechanism where shallow systems can produce calc-alkaline magmas. Structural control of assimilation has been proposed to occur both on fine scales—in which local crustal thickness and stress regime determine magma–crust interaction (Kay et al., 1982)—and at regional scales of magmatic arcs where configuration of the subduction zone determines magmatic character (Portnyagin and Manea, 2008).

A B S T R A C T

The role of changing crustal interaction and plumbing geometry in modulating calc-alkaline vs. tholeiitic magma affinity is well illustrated by the influence of 70 km thick crust beneath Volcán Parinacota. Changes in petrologic affinity correlate with periods of cone-building, sector collapse, and rebuilding of the volcano over the last 52 ka, and are well explained by changes in magma recharge regime. With increasing recharge and magma output, lavas transition from low-Fe, strongly calc-alkaline, phenocryst-rich silicic compositions to medium-Fe, near-tholeiitic, mafic, and aphanitic characteristics. Strontium isotope data show that the change in magma regime did not affect all parts of the system simultaneously; these are characterized by distinctive 87Sr/86Sr ratios, which suggest an initially compartmentalized system. Relatively high (230Th/232Th) activity ratios of ~0.72 in early-erupted calc-alkaline lavas are consistent with interaction with high-U upper crust. Low (230Th/232Th) activity ratios of ~0.55 and up to 33% Th-excess in younger near-tholeiitic lavas correlate with steep REE patterns, indicating lower-crustal interaction. Thorium-excesses at the time of eruption approach the maximum that can be generated via small-degree garnet-residual melting in the lower crust or mantle and imply that transit time through the crustal column for the most tholeiitic magmas had to be short, on the order of <2 × 10^4 yr. In contrast, lavas with greatest calc-alkalinity are also at or near secular equilibrium, suggesting stagnation times >3 × 10^5 yr in the upper crust. In addition to more traditional explanations tied to magma source, expression of low-Fe ‘calc-alkaline’ (CA) vs. medium-Fe ‘near-tholeiitic’ (TH) magma series at the scale of individual volcanoes is likely to be modulated by transitions from compartmentalized, stagnant, assimilation-prone ‘dirty’ systems (CA) to ‘clean’ systems (TH) that are characterized by rapid magma throughput and minimal opportunity for upper-crustal contamination.

© 2009 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.
An important component to understanding magmatic evolution lies in the temporal control of open-system processes in a maturing arc system. Myers et al. (1985) advocate thermal maturation of the lithospheric conduit as a mechanism for generating calc-alkaline magmas, where magmas that stall and undergo extensive contamination produce “dirty” calc-alkaline differentiation trends, whereas high-magma fluxes coupled with short crustal residence times tend to favor “clean” tholeiitic differentiation. The Myers et al. (1985) model implies that differences between adjacent volcanoes are due to variably mature plumbing systems, rather than a consequence of variable crustal structure or thickness. Here we test the hypotheses that (1) degree of Fe-enrichment is a function of time and changing locus of magma–crust interaction, (2) phase equilibria mechanisms are of subordinate importance relative to upper-crustal assimilation in producing the wide array of Fe-enrichment observed in continental arc magmas, and (3) pseudo-trends that do not correspond to experimentally determined cotectics result from mixing of these variably Fe-enriched magmas.

Depth and elapsed time since magma–crust interaction are reflected in rare-earth element (REE), U, and Th elemental fractions and resulting 238U–230Th systematics, respectively. These elements are fractionated by garnet, which is residual during deep crustal assimilation and can be a stable liquidus phase during high-P crystallization (Macpherson et al., 2006). Accordingly, increasedREE and U–Th fractionation correlates with continental lithospheric thickness (Hildreth and Moorbath, 1988; Kay et al., 1999; Macpherson, 2008) and Garrison et al. (2006) proposed thickened crust as the explanation for 238U–Th excesses in continental arc magmas, which contrasts with the 238U–Th excesses that are prevalent in island arcs (Turner et al., 2003).

U-series isotopes track time since fractionation (i.e., melting) and have been used to demonstrate instances of both rapid wedge-to-surface transit (Turner et al., 2001) and >10^5 yr of magma ponding prior to differentiation and eruption (Jicha et al., 2005) in island arcs. George et al. (2004) found that time scales of magmatic evolution were similar and short at Akutan (tholeiitic) and Aniakchak (mainly calc-alkaline) systems in the Aleutian arc, but that differentiation was more efficient in the calc-alkaline system. Transit times for continental arc magmas erupted through thicker crust, in general, appear to be longer, where any 238U– and 226Ra-excesses produced during melt generation has decayed to secular equilibrium by the time of eruption (Reagan et al., 2003). If magmas ascend through continental crust more slowly than in island arcs because of lower average continental crust densities, understanding of how, where, and for how long magmas stagnate within the crustal column is incomplete.

Here, we aim to distinguish chemical and U–Th isotopic characteristics that arise primarily through deep vs. shallow crustal interaction, and gauge how the pace of magma ascent and recharge rates into the shallow magma reservoirs change over time. We take advantage of differences in 238U/230Th) between lower and upper-crustal rocks to resolve the depth of interaction, and use the degree of secular disequilibrium to constrain time since deep crustal assimilation. We reconcile variable Fe-enrichment (i.e. tholeiitic vs. calc-alkaline character) with changing storage depths and differing rates of transport through the crust. Instead of comparing volcanoes along a segment of arc as is widely done (Myers et al., 1985; Hildreth and Moorbath, 1988; Kersting et al., 1996; Portnyagin and Manea, 2008), we focus on a single well-dated arc volcano on thick crust that changed from calc-alkaline to near-tholeiitic compositions during its history. New major- and trace-element data, U–Th, and Sr isotopic data for lavas at Volcán Parinacota (N. Chile) that have been dated by 40Ar/39Ar (Hora et al., 2007) provide a high-resolution time-series of chemical and isotopic data that link edifice evolution, changing configuration of the magma reservoir, and variable magma source.

2. Geological setting and volcanology overview

Volcán Parinacota, a 46 km² Pleistocene–Holocene stratocone in the Andean Central Volcanic Zone (CVZ — Fig. 1 inset) was chosen for this study because of its location atop 70 km thick Precambrian continental crust (Beck et al., 1996; Yuan et al., 2002), which maximizes opportunity for crustal interaction. Variability in composition and age of crustal materials encountered at different depths are expected to impart distinct chemical and isotopic signatures to magmas comprising successive stages of volcano growth. Furthermore, detailed knowledge of Parinacota’s eruptive chronology, extensive mapping at the resolution of individual lava flows, and thorough sampling of all major eruptive phases enable evaluation of chemical and textural changes over time.

2.1. Thick CVZ crust and its role in determining magma chemistry

The presence of thick crust imposes spatial and depth constraints on the mantle wedge material available for melting. Because the slab depth is similar to other arcs, the height of the asthenospheric wedge is reduced to ~30 km (Allmendinger et al., 1997); no part of it is shallow enough to be in the spinel-peridotite field (Robinson and Wood, 1998) as would be the case in island arcs, and therefore any wedge melting in the CVZ likely occurs in the presence of residual garnet. Thick crust also suggests garnet stability at the rheological and density boundaries comprising the base of the lithosphere and crust, respectively; we expect that partial melts sourced from the base of the CVZ crust and melts crystallizing there would show evidence of garnet-residual processes (Lee et al., 2006).

CVZ crust is compositionally diverse both laterally and vertically, however sparse basement exposure and extensive young volcanic and sedimentary cover preclude direct assessment of mid- and lower-crustal composition and structure. Lateral variation has been gauged via isotopic compositions of volcanic rocks, which reflect vertically integrated composition and age of underlying basement (Wörner et al., 1992; Aitcheson et al., 1995; Mamani et al., 2008). Parinacota is located within the Arequipa crustal domain (Ramos, 2008), where contaminated magmas are characterized by relatively unradiogenic Pb, low εNd values, and elevated 87Sr/86Sr ratios from 0.706 to 0.708 (Mamani et al., 2008). Correlation between 3-D density structure and inferred chemical domains indicates that the proportion of mafic lower-crustal rocks to felsic upper-crustal lithologies is relatively high beneath the Arequipa domain (Mamani et al., 2008).

Vertical variation near Parinacota consists of unknown lower-crustal lithologies, mid-crust constrained by limited outcrops of metamorphic basement, and a veneer of Cenozoic volcanic and volcanoclastic rocks, sediments sourced largely from them, and their intrusive equivalents at depth. Because all of these units are significantly older than the half-life of 230Th and have a wide range in U/Th ratios, this translates into a large spread along the equiline that distinguishes each of the potential assimilants. Paleozoic amphibolite and gneiss exposed ~40 km to the west at Belén, and mid-Proterozoic granulite and charnockite ~50 km to the east at Cerro Uyarári (Wörner et al., 2000b) both have low 206Pb/208Pb, suggesting long-term depletion of U/Pb and U/Th ratios. These low U/Th ratios correspond to secular equilibrium activity ratios for 238U/232Th and 230Th/232Th of ~0.4–0.5 (Bourdon et al., 2000; Wörner et al., 2000b). Basement rocks from S. Peru have 238U/232Th and 230Th/232Th as low as 0.2 (Mamani et al., in press). In contrast, Cenozoic volcanic rocks that include the 22.7–19.4 Ma Oaxaya Igneibrites and 2.7 Ma Laupa-Perez Igneibrite (Wörner et al., 2000a) have secular equilibrium activity ratios of ~0.7 and 1.0, respectively. Because the inferred source of the Laupa-Perez Igneibrite is ~15 km to the northwest of Parinacota (Wörner et al., 2000a), recycling of its solidified intrusive equivalents by Parinacota magmas is possible.

2.2. Volcano evolution and unit descriptions

We focus on the last 52 ka of the 163 ka volcanic history at Parinacota (Hora et al., 2007) because (1) following a significant hiatus, the magma reservoir operated continuously during this time and was sampled frequently by eruption, and (2) the succession of
erupted compositions suggests correlation between evolution of the ediﬁce and change in reservoir processes. Initially (52–28 ka) a number of small, spatially separated centers with distinct composition (dp, occ, ocb, oc1, oc1a—Fig. 1) amalgamated to form an ‘old cone’ ediﬁce (oc2—28–20 ka). Successively erupted magma batches are more mafic than their predecessors, necessitating an open-system (mixing) model (Wörner et al., 1988). The old cone collapsed between 20 and 15 ka (Hora et al., 2007), forming a 6 km$^3$ debris avalanche deposit (Clavero et al., 2002). Unlike Mt. St. Helens, sector collapse at Parinacota apparently was not accompanied by eruption of juvenile material, but was followed by rapid building of a young cone (yc). Most post-collapse lavas have relatively homogenous major-element composition and erupted from the central vent, forming a symmetrical cone; however, a volumetrically small subset of these lavas erupted from flank vents (Ajata ﬂows) have distinct trace-element composition. These ﬂank lavas can not be related to each other by crystal fractionation, nor can they be directly parental to the evolved lavas of the old cone (Davidson et al., 1990).

Composition of mafic inputs is obscured in homogenized melts erupted from the young cone summit vent (yc), however ﬂank Ajata ﬂows (a1, a2, a3, and a4) have more diverse trace-element compositions indicative of their origin. Strontium and Ba concentration (hereafter noted as [Sr] and [Ba]) are particularly variable among the Ajata ﬂows; unit a3 has anomalously high [Sr] and [Ba] relative to other CVZ

---

Fig. 1. Simplified geologic map and morphological evolution of Parinacota Volcano, unit ages from Hora et al. (2007). Parinacota units overlie the adjacent Pomerape ediﬁce and Chungará andesites (ca). Following a 65 ka hiatus, several magma types were concurrently erupted in the earliest phase of the old cone: occ—sparsely porphyritic dacties from the northern portion of the old cone, dp—porphyritic rhyodacites of the dome plateau that underlie the southern part of the ediﬁce, and cone-building andesites (oc1—47–37 ka and oc1a—33–28 ka). In the time interval 31–28 ka, voluminous eruptions (~3 km$^3$) of the ‘border dacite’ (ocb) built much of the south ﬂank of the old cone. Old cone history since 28 ka is represented by andesitic lavas that contain variable amounts of phenocrysts (cpx-andesites through plag-amphibole-andesites, oc2—28–22 ka). After sector collapse, the basaltic andesitic–andesitic young cone (yc—sampled interval 8 ka to present) formed a conical ediﬁce that masks the sector collapse scar. Most recently, a series of Ajata ﬂank vents (a1, a2, a3, and a4—10–2 ka) erupted the most primitive lavas on the volcano (53–59% SiO$_2$).
magnas. Zoned plagioclase in mixed pre-collapse lavas (Ginibre et al., 2002; Ginibre and Wörner, 2007) records presence of both high-[Sr, Ba] and low-[Sr, Ba] melts during crystal growth. These two contrasting Ajata compositions have been identified as mixing endmembers for recharge during the entire history of Parinacota (Ginibre and Wörner, 2007). Entenmann (1994) showed using \(^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr}\) and \(^{18}\text{O}\) that both types of Ajata magma incorporated ~15\% crustal material. Bourdon et al. (2000) were first to show that \(^{230}\text{Th}/^{238}\text{U}\) correlates with La/Yb and Ba/Hf ratios, indicating that trace-element fractionation is of recent origin.

3. Sample selection and analytical techniques

Major- and trace-element contents and Sr isotope compositions are presented in Supplemental File 1 for all 57 samples that have been dated using \(^{40}\text{Ar}/^{39}\text{Ar}\) geochronology (Hora et al., 2007). Thirty-two samples representative of all major stages of volcano evolution were analyzed for \(^{230}\text{Th}/^{238}\text{U}\) isotopes (Table 1), and can be correlated to a more extensive geochemical dataset from previous studies (Wörner et al., 1988; Davidson et al., 1990). Field methods, stratigraphic context of samples, and a detailed map can be found in Hora et al. (2007). Sample preparation and analytical methods for all major-element analyses (XRF), trace-element analyses (quadrupole ICP-MS), Sr isotope measurements (TIMS) and U–Th isotope measurements (MC-ICP-MS) are given in Supplemental File 2.

4. Results

Below we first cast the results in terms of a calc-alkaline (CA) and tholeiitic (TH) index to highlight distinct petrologic affinities that are mirrored in trace-element and isotopic data. Both short- and long-term trends in chemical and isotopic compositions are then placed in the context of spatial relations on the volcano and in the region.

4.1. CA/TH index and its use

All Parinacota magmas are calc-alkaline, but their degree of Fe-enrichment at a given silica content varies (Fig. 2). Recognizing that a

### Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample</th>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>(^{40}\text{Ar}/^{39}\text{Ar Age}) (ka)</th>
<th>(^{87}\text{Sr}/^{86}\text{Sr})</th>
<th>(^{18}\text{O})</th>
<th>(^{230}\text{Th}/^{238}\text{U})</th>
<th>(^{232}\text{Th}/^{238}\text{U})</th>
<th>(^{230}\text{Th}/^{232}\text{Th})</th>
<th>(^{232}\text{Th}/^{238}\text{Th})</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ajata flows</td>
<td>a1</td>
<td>9.9 ± 2.1</td>
<td>7.702</td>
<td>1.135</td>
<td>0.510 ± 0.009</td>
<td>0.562 ± 0.010</td>
<td>0.567 ± 0.009</td>
<td>1.267 ± 0.028</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a2</td>
<td>5.8 ± 7.4</td>
<td>6.129</td>
<td>1.701</td>
<td>0.842 ± 0.005</td>
<td>0.709 ± 0.004</td>
<td>0.702 ± 0.001</td>
<td>0.834 ± 0.013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a3</td>
<td>4.8 ± 4.0</td>
<td>8.389</td>
<td>1.195</td>
<td>0.432 ± 0.002</td>
<td>0.545 ± 0.003</td>
<td>0.559 ± 0.005</td>
<td>1.272 ± 0.014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a4</td>
<td>2.6 ± 1.3</td>
<td>7.830</td>
<td>1.354</td>
<td>0.525 ± 0.011</td>
<td>0.560 ± 0.004</td>
<td>0.561 ± 0.004</td>
<td>1.069 ± 0.023</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All analytical uncertainties reported at 2\sigma precision, external reproducibility based on replicate standard and sample analyses.

Decay constants used for activity calculations: \(^{238}\text{U}, 1.5513 \times 10^{-10}/\text{yr}\); \(^{232}\text{Th}, 9.15777 \times 10^{-5}/\text{yr}\) (Cheng et al., 2000); \(^{230}\text{Th}, 4.548 \times 10^{-11}/\text{yr}\).
which is tied to the ratio of slopes on a SiO\textsubscript{2} vs. FeO history (Fig. 3b). (230Th/232Th) decreased (Fig. 3c), and the magnitude of U (Fig. 3e) but 87Sr/86Sr ratios during this time period formed three groups. Prior to 28 ka, large diversity in SiO\textsubscript{2} content existed (∼600 ppm and [Ba]≈1000–1200 ppm). The constant-SiO\textsubscript{2} group (occ and ocf — Fig. 3) has a restricted range in 87Sr/86Sr (0.70681 ± 2), (230Th/232Th)\textsubscript{0} varies from 0.699 to 0.716, is in U–Th secular equilibrium, has [Sr]≈1100 ppm and [Ba]≈1300 ppm; the later-erupted lavas (oc1a) have higher 87Sr/86Sr=0.70672 ± 2, but similar [Sr] and [Ba].

The time interval after eruption of large-volume dacite flows at 28 ka is characterized by scattered trends in chemical and isotopic data. In oc2, SiO\textsubscript{2} ranges between 57 and 62 wt.%, and 87Sr/86Sr varies between 0.70660 and 0.70681, with no correlation to other compositional parameters. (230Th/232Th)\textsubscript{0} and (230Th/238U) for three analyzed samples in this group are highly variable (Fig. 3c–d). The lavas that compose the main edifice of the young cone are relatively homogeneous in SiO\textsubscript{2} contents of 57.5–59.8 wt.%, as well as (230Th/232Th)\textsubscript{0} ratios of 0.561–0.595, but are variable with respect to [Sr] of 942–1108 ppm, 87Sr/86Sr of 0.70660–0.70681, and the degree of secular disequilibrium, where (230Th/238U)\textsubscript{0} varies from 1.099 to 1.336.

4.4. U–Th data and regional comparison

Despite eruption ages of <52 ka — much shorter than the half-life of 230Th — many pre-collapse Parinacota lavas are within uncertainty of secular equilibrium. On an equiline diagram, U–Th data form an array (Fig. 4) between near-equine dome plateau (dp) lavas with (230Th/232Th)\textsubscript{0} = 0.72, and two clusters of young (post-collapse) lavas. These two groups are typified by a1 and a2 mixing endmembers as suggested by Gibnire and Wörner (2007); both have low (230Th/232Th)\textsubscript{0} = 0.55 but differing amounts of Th-excess. The lower Ajata flow (a2) is distinct from all other post-collapse lavas because it has U-excess, and higher (230Th/232Th)\textsubscript{0}. The overall range in (230Th/238U)\textsubscript{0} is bracketed by lower-crustal and upper-crustal lithologies as discussed in Section 2.2.

5. Discussion

We focus on the depths and extent of crustal interaction as constrained by trace-element and isotopic data before discussing how involvement of magmas with various sources changed the magmatic system over its history. All data are confined to a mixing tetrahedron (Supplemental File 3) with apices defined by the chemical and isotopic compositions of the early-erupted dome plateau (dp), and Ajata lavas a1, a2, and a3. These three mafic endmembers erupted from flank vents are important because they are not polluted by mixing with magma that was resident in the shallow reservoir, and we interpret compositional variability to reflect different degrees and locations of partial melting within the crust. Combined REE and Th isotope, and major-element data suggest that the degree to which shallow contamination overprints the signature of deep crustal melting largely determines the calc–alkaline of differentiated magmas. Even though mixing among endmembers undoubtedly needs to be considered in the interpretation of Th isotope data (see also Section 5.4), the extent of eruption-age-corrected Th isotope disequilibria of mafic lavas imposes time limits on magma storage and ascent.

5.1. Chemical signatures of deep processing

Steep REE patterns in Parinacota lavas which have chondrite-normalized (La/Yb)\textsubscript{n} ratios between 18 and 45 (Supplemental File 4), indicate involvement of garnet either as a residual phase during
Garnet-residual melting can occur over a wide range of depths in the CVZ, from the asthenospheric wedge to mid-crustal levels. Because water suppresses plagioclase crystallization and stabilizes both garnet and amphibole in the mid- to lower-crust (Muntener et al., 2001), deep hydrous arc magmas may also show evidence of liquidus garnet crystallization.

Detection of amphibole vs. garnet fractionation in the deep crust for a single melt batch has been demonstrated using Dy/Yb trends (Davidson et al., 2007), however deconvolution of the effects of garnet-residual melting can be problematic. Differences in mineral-melt partition coefficients \( D \) between amphibole (\( D_{\text{Dy}} < D_{\text{Yb}} \)) and garnet (\( D_{\text{Dy}} > D_{\text{Yb}} \)) result in opposite Dy/Yb trends in evolving melt. Volcanoes on thin crust tend to have well-constrained negative trends in Dy/Yb vs. SiO\(_2\), indicating (1) amphibole fractionation and (2) relatively homogenous Dy/Yb in parental magmas. This is not the case for Parinacota, and most other volcanoes built on crust exceeding 40 km (Fig. 5). Positive trends indicative of garnet fractionation such as those in Surigao Peninsula (Philippines) lavas are rare (Macpherson, 2008). Because enrichment in incompatible elements is highly dependent on the melt fraction \( F \), small differences in degree of garnet-residual melting where \( F \) is small can have a disproportionately large effect on Dy/Yb, and can easily override the signal from fractional crystallization where \( F \) is large. At Parinacota, overall elevated Dy/Yb most likely result from garnet-residual melting and scatter caused by small differences in \( F \) during melting among magma batches impedes detection of a fractionation signal.

Correlation among La/Yb, Dy/Yb, and \((230\text{Th}/232\text{Th})\) ratios in Ajata endmember samples indicates that degree of garnet-residual partial melting likely controls all three parameters (Supplemental File 5a,b) and that trace-element fractionation is of recent origin (Bourdon et al., 2000). A lack of correlation between La/Yb and CA/TH index (Supplemental File 5c) indicates that Mg/Fe ratios are not controlled by source processes. Instead, correlation of CA/TH with contamination indices (SiO\(_2\), K\(_2\)O, and Cs — Supplemental File 5d–f) indicates that trends of variable CA/TH index are likely mixing lines, in which upper-crustal assimilation controls Mg/Fe ratio. Mixing may be responsible
for the global prevalence of trends that cross from tholeiitic to calc-alkaline fields with increasing SiO₂ and the paucity of trends in the opposite direction.

5.2. Mantle and lower-crustal effects on U–Th disequilibrium

The REE evidence for interaction of Parinacota magmas with deep garnet-bearing crust bears on how U–Th isotope data are interpreted. Differences in (238U/232Th) activity ratios at similar (230Th/232Th) reflect differences in melting conditions that produced the parental magmas (Fig. 6a). Fluid-mobile U carried from the subducting slab into the mantle wedge will produce U-excess (Allegre and Condomines, 1982) and flank eruption a2 is inferred to have partially retained such a mantle-derived signature. The near-equiline high (230Th/232Th) magmas of the dome plateau (dp) endmember also suggest a parental melt with initial U-excess and subsequent decay to secular equilibrium, assuming similar mantle wedge U–Th ratios as post-collapse lavas. In contrast, most post-collapse lavas (a1, a2, and yc) have Th-excesses. Because CVZ mantle melts are sourced entirely within the garnet peridotite stability field, the degree of U-excess may be reduced relative to that inherited from slab fluids. Both U and Th are incompatible in mantle minerals, and thus >10% partial melting results in 230Th-excesses of only ~2%. Similarly, fractional crystallization of garnet, where DTh/ DU ≫ 1 produces Th/U-excess only at unrealistically high degrees of crystallization (>99%); neither large degree partial melting in the mantle wedge nor moderate amounts of crystallization are viable mechanisms for the large Th-excess observed in young cone and Ajata lavas, and is consistent with high Dy/Yb.

Small degrees of partial melting of garnet-bearing lithologies are required to explain the Th-excesses at Parinacota because only under these conditions is Th fractionated from U to a sufficient degree. Even so, 1 and 2% batch partial melts of Belen garnet biotite gneiss (5% garnet) initially at secular equilibrium will generate 14 and 7% Th-excess, respectively (Table 2). To produce observed Th-excesses, a putative lower-crustal lithology with higher garnet mode is required. Batch melting of garnet pyroxenite (25% garnet) at 1 and 2% melt fractions, produces 29 and 19% Th-excess, respectively (Table 2). The above models are a highly simplified case: Th-excess depends on the proportion of garnet, which largely controls bulk D, as well as the choice of mineral partition coefficients used. Determinations of DTh/ DU ratios in garnet of various compositions vary from 1.3 to 9.3 (e.g., van Westrenen et al., 1999; Pertermann et al., 2004), but most are within the range of 3–6. Here, we use partition coefficients of Elkins et al. (2008) for garnet which yield DTh/ DU = 4.06. We use partition coefficients of Wood et al. (1999) for clinopyroxene because they account for greater U compatibility at high pressure, and those of Blundy and Wood (2003) for other phases.

Dynamic mantle melting models show that: (1) decreased melting rates result in ingrowth of 230Th in the unmelten portion of the source prior to melt separation (Williams and Gill, 1989; Zou and Zindler, 2000), and (2) decreased porosity in the melting region (Zou and Zindler, 2000) can fractionate Th from U enough to increase (230Th/ 238U) activity ratios by 5–15%. Similarly, we envision that melting at several levels in the lower- and mid-crust, may increase Th/U fractionation relative to simple batch models. If operating continuously, this is analogous to zone-refining concentration of Th relative to U in the melt as it migrates through the crust.

We anticipate that melt which exited the melting- assimilation-storage-homogenization (MASH) zone was a hybrid made up of mantle and crustal melts (Fig. 6a). Trace-element and isotopic modeling of a2 and a3 lavas by Entenmann (1994) inferred a 6:1 ratio of mantle:crustal components. Because U and Th concentrations are relatively high in the small-degree crustal melts that are required to explain the large Th-excesses, such melts will dominate the U and Th budget of the resulting mixture. Therefore, Th/U ratios in the hybrid melt are relatively insensitive to the degree of initial U-excess in the mantle melt. For example, admixture of a mantle melt with 20% U-excess decreases Th-excess in crustal melt by only ~2–4%. These considerations indicate that Th-excesses in Parinacota magmas are relatively independent of the characteristics of the mantle component involved, and may be confidently ascribed to lower-crustal melting processes involving garnet-bearing rocks.
5.3. Constraints on time since deep crustal partial melting

The magnitude of Th-excesses in post-collapse samples requires that elapsed time between lower-crustal interaction and eruption was short. Measured Th-excesses in the subset of young cone lavas that are similar to the a3 component approach the maximum Th-excess that can be produced by crustal melting (Fig. 6). The bulk of global U-Th data from continental arcs has \((^{230}\text{Th} / ^{238}\text{U}) < 1.2\), but very few volcanoes, e.g. Mt. Adams (Jicha et al., 2009), have greater Th-excess than young cone lavas at Parinacota. Collectively, these data suggest that -40% Th-excess represents a limiting case in terms of slow melting rates, low porosity, and small melt fractions derived from arc crust. Because eruption age-corrected Parinacota data are near this limit, maximum allowable crustal transit times are on the order of a few tens of ka (Fig. 6b). In contrast, the origin of the silicic, near-equiline, high U/Th endmember in Fig. 6a, typified by the dome plateau lavas (dp) requires a different origin: either (1) assimilation of secular equilibrium upper-crustal material in absence of a garnet residue or (2) highly fractionated, old (>250 ka) magmas that had initial U-excess. If (1) is correct, and both the upper-crustal assimilant and the hybrid melt (dp) are on the equiline, then the input melt that initiated assimilation also must have been on the equiline. This would occur if the input melt either (case 1a) had no initial \((^{230}\text{Th} / ^{238}\text{U})\) disequilibrium and may be young, or (case 1b) was initially in U-series disequilibrium, therefore requiring enough time to decay to secular equilibrium. If (2) is correct, and dp is a highly fractionated melt with initial U-excess (similar to a2), long storage times are required, similar to case 1b. Indeed, these may be the processes responsible for the high U/Th of the ignimbrites. Relative importance of processes (1) and (2) is difficult to constrain, and both likely contributed. The finding of short transit times for mafic magma, in contrast to silicic magma that is long-lived or contains recycled components reinforces findings of Reagan et al. (2003) that silicic magma is more likely to stall than mafic magma. In the case of Parinacota, U/Th ratios in silicic rocks are more similar to ignimbrites than to metamorphic basement and thus constrain the depth of stagnation to the upper-most crust, i.e. in the shallow plumbing system immediately beneath the volcano.

5.4. Evolution of the volcanic plumbing system

We develop a conceptual model for the temporal development of the magma plumbing system bounded by the major events in the volcanic history (Fig. 7). Our aim is to show how the deep crustal signature permeates the system and that erupted composition is a result of the shifting mass balance from silicic (possibly largely recycled) upper-crustal to mafic lower-crustal components. For each time interval, we discuss the likely configuration and spatial

![Figure 6](image_url)

Fig. 6. (a) Schematic illustration of the effects of partial melting of various mantle and crustal lithologies. Fluid-fluxed partial melting of a heterogeneous mantle wedge results in U-excess melts that have \((^{230}\text{Th} / ^{238}\text{U})\) indicative of the mantle source (1). Partial melting of low \((^{230}\text{Th} / ^{238}\text{U})\) lower-crustal lithologies (filled stars) with residual garnet, initiated by underplating of (1) results in Th-excess, which is maximized by lower degrees of partial melting (2). Mixing of (1) and (2) results in hybrid melts that plot near (2) due to higher concentrations of both U and Th in (2) relative to (1). Partial melting of high \((^{230}\text{Th} / ^{238}\text{U})\) upper-crustal materials (e.g. ignimbrites, open stars) results in minimal U-Th fractionation. Mixing of upper-crustal near-equiline melts with hybrid melts (1+2) can result in an array similar to variation observed in Parinacota data (open circle symbols). (b) Maximum Th-excess that can be produced by processes such as (2) is ~40% (gray shaded area). Starting from such maximum allowable amount of Th-excess to the eruption-age corrected Th-excess observed at Parinacota provides an upper limit on ascent times from the region of partial melting to the surface, e.g. 40 and 18 ka for two representative young cone samples. It is likely that true transit times were faster if parental Th-excess was smaller than the maximum amount (e.g. transit times for the two samples decrease to 27 and 6 ka, respectively, if parental Th-excess had been 35%). Unit symbols as in Fig. 2, symbol size is representative of average uncertainty.

5.4. Evolution of the volcanic plumbing system

We develop a conceptual model for the temporal development of the magma plumbing system bounded by the major events in the volcanic history (Fig. 7). Our aim is to show how the deep crustal signature permeates the system and that erupted composition is a result of the shifting mass balance from silicic (possibly largely recycled) upper-crustal to mafic lower-crustal components. For each time interval, we discuss the likely configuration and spatial
arrangement of sub-volcanic reservoirs, the degree to which they operated as open or closed systems, and link changes in the magmatic system to morphology of the edifice.

5.4.1. Prior to 35 ka

During the early portion of old cone history, three texturally, chemically, and mineralogically distinct types of magma (occ, dp and oc1 — Fig. 7), are grouped spatially — each built a sector of the edifice. They do not form clusters with respect to their age; rather each petrologic group yielded 40Ar/39Ar ages that span a large part of the interval between 52 and 35 ka, indicating that evolution in a single magma reservoir is unlikely. Moreover, uniformity in 87Sr/86Sr ratios within each group and disparity between groups suggests that these lavas represent contributions from three long-lived separate reservoirs (Fig. 7). Time-invariant 87Sr/86Sr ratios and increasing SiO2 content of the southwest flank dp lavas with time (Fig. 3e–f), are consistent with fractional crystallization in an isolated magma reservoir. In contrast, the group with the highest 87Sr/86Sr ratios (occ) is nearly invariant with respect to 87Sr/86Sr ratios and SiO2 contents (Fig. 3e–f), suggesting a steady-state system where heat input is balanced by cooling and heat removal by eruption.

North-flank (oc1) lavas have low 87Sr/86Sr ratios coupled with an increase in [Sr] with time, indicating that open-system recharge had occurred and that the admixed component was primarily a high-[Sr] basaltic andesite similar to a3. We interpret magma recharge to have affected the northern reservoir first, whereas the southern portions of the system (occ and dp) were not recharged at that time. Although eruption location provides some constraint on lateral arrangement of old cone magma bodies, their depth is constrained by the presence of amphibole, requiring pressures >100 MPa, or deeper than 3 km (Rutherford and Hill, 1993). Narrow oxide rims on amphibole phenocrysts suggest rapid ascent from amphibole-stable pressures.

5.4.2. 35–28 ka

Lavas from a brief period of increased flux between 31 and 28 ka (ocb) have indistinguishable 87Sr/86Sr ratios from the occ lavas in the previous time interval (Fig. 3f), and have the same phenocryst inventory, although crystals in ocb are larger, with, for example, sanidine crystals up to 1 cm. Based on the similarities in isotopic compositions and phenocryst assemblage, we interpret a genetic link between the thermally buffered occ reservoir and younger ocb lavas (Fig. 7). The other lavas erupted in this time interval (oc1a) have variable texture, mineralogy, and 87Sr/86Sr ratios that are different from those of any previous magma batch (Fig. 3f). Their near-secular equilibrium (230Th/238U) ratios and intermediate 87Sr/86Sr ratios are similar to a1. These data are permissive of either recharge of the northern reservoir by a ma fi c magma that had already incorporated mid- to upper-crustal melts (a1), or wall-rock contamination along the margin of the oc1 reservoir that occurred after recharge by lower-crustal magma a3.

5.4.3. 28–20 ka

We interpret the large amount of scatter in chemical and isotopic compositions during this time period to reflect frequent recharge, corroborating phenocryst zoning observations (Guibère and Wörner, 2007). It is likely that consolidation of three infrequently recharged sub-reservoirs that were active from 52 to 35 ka occurred, two of which were extant by the time of border dacite eruptions. We suggest
that increased recharge led to development of a single magma reservoir. Such coalescence of small isolated magma batches by increased recharge has also been postulated for other volcanic centers, e.g. the 39 ka Campanian Ignimbrite and the 15 ka Neapolitan Yellow Tuff in Italy (Pabst et al., 2008).

5.4.4. Sector collapse

A bomb deposited on top of old cone lavas yielded a $^{40}$Ar/$^{39}$Ar age of 22.4 ± 7.5 ka and is within error of the estimated time of sector collapse (constrained to ~15–20 ky, Hora et al., 2007). This bomb has a relatively mafic composition, and $^{87}$Sr/$^{86}$Sr and $(^{230}$Th$/^{232}$Th) ratios that are similar to young cone lavas. Its composition indicates that by the time of sector collapse, magma recharge had already changed the magmatic system to a composition indistinguishable from young cone lavas. In most other volcanoes that have been studied in similar detail (Pallister et al., 1992; Morgan et al., 2006; Wark et al., 2007), recharge is interpreted to trigger large eruptions within tens to hundreds of years. In contrast to these, the Parinacota data suggest a significantly more protracted recharge interval of ~30 ka, and no ensuing climactic eruption.

5.4.5. 15 ka to present

Two clusters of $(^{230}$Th$/^{238}$U) ratios in young cone samples indicate a variable mid-– upper-crustal overprint of magmas that previously interacted with garnet-bearing lower crust. The cluster that is similar to flank eruption a3 is interpreted to have a minimal shallow crustal overprint, whereas the cluster that is similar to flank eruption a1 likely reflects more shallow crustal assimilation. Symmetry of the young cone edifice indicates that the bulk of the magma erupted from the same shallow conduit. While relatively uniform young cone lavas were exclusively erupted from the central vent, chemical and isotopic heterogeneity increases with distance from the summit. Despite broadly similar major-element compositions and eruption from the same low-elevation flank vent within 1 ka of one another, Ajata lavas a2 and a3 represent nearly the entire range of $(^{230}$Th$/^{232}$Th) and $(^{230}$Th$/^{232}$U) and a significant portion of the $^{87}$Sr/$^{86}$Sr range found at Parinacota. We suggest that these magmas remained distinct because they bypassed the main reservoir and thereby avoided mixing with a larger volume of stored magma. They may represent heterogeneity of inputs from the lower crust that were otherwise involved in mafic recharge. Whereas a2 incorporated xenocrysts from the dome plateau through which it erupted, a3 shows little interaction with dome plateau rocks or the a2 magma that preceded it.

5.5. Transition from calc-alkaline to near-tholeiitic magmas as a function of magma throughput and self-insulation of the conduit system

A decrease in CA/TH index (Fig. 3a) occurred between the time of border dacite eruption (28 ka) and sector collapse (~15–20 ka, Hora et al., 2007). This change is interpreted to coincide with reorganization of the magma system from a multi-reservoir system to a single reservoir, a decrease in magma transit time through the crustal column, and increased throughput of magma. The shallow magma system is envisioned to have modified inputs from the lower crust via low-pressure fractional crystallization, magma mixing, and assimilation. All of these processes would overprint lower-crustal chemical signatures, and assimilation and mixing can change isotopic ratios. The amount of overprinting is expected to be dependent on magma residence time and temperature contrast: as shallow residence time increases, so does the likelihood of assimilation and incorporation of remobilized crystals, leading to more phenocryst-rich and porphyritic textures. A decrease in the MASH-to-shallow transit time minimized the effects of shallow overprinting as the system evolved from low- to high-magma fluxes. Formation of crystal cumulates produced by early magmas is envisioned to have self-insulated the plumbing system, which decreased the likelihood of subsequent assimilation of host rock, particularly if magma transit time through the crust was reduced. Conduct self-insulation is expected to move overall magma composition from calc-alkaline to tholeiitic affinities, as it decreases the efficiency with which magma can assimilate shallow wall-rock. The relative importance of self-insulation and increased magma flux are not resolvable at Parinacota. However, sparse data from four migrating volcanic centers in Central America suggest analogous age progression from old, slow, silicic, and calc-alkaline to young, fast, mafic, and tholeiitic (Halsor and Rose, 1988). These observations indicate that either the zone of self-insulation extends to distances similar to the 5 km displacement between old and young vents, or that it is subordinate to the effect of increased throughput.

6. Conclusions

Change from upper- to lower-crustal magma characteristics in the Parinacota system was a result of both an increase in throughput (recharge and eruption rates increased), and a decrease in transit times from the lower crust to the surface. The initial state of the system was a highly compartmentalized shallow reservoir, in which long storage and crystallization times and significant assimilation of secular equilibrium material resulted in crust-like $(^{230}$Th$/^{232}$Th). The final state was a simpler system in which increased recharge was balanced by high eruption rates. Increased recharge frequency initiated consolidation of reservoirs, which did not affect all parts of the system simultaneously, and took ~15 ka to complete. A remaining problem is determining how output from the MASH zone is modulated, affecting flux through the crust, rate of ascent, and frequency of recharge. Because crustal structure and stress regime are likely invariant on timescales comparable to edifice building, and pressure effects of the edifice itself decrease significantly with depth, neither can affect output from the lower crust. Some possibilities are that separation of buoyant melt bodies may proceed sporadically, or that variability in MASH output mirrors changes in lower-crustal input of mantle melts.

Slow and fast magma throughput regimes have been well documented separately in the Central Andes based on volcano histories and ranges of magma composition. As a general rule, relatively short-lived volcanic systems (~0.3 Ma) have symmetrical cones of largely mafic andesite compositions (Wörner et al., 2000a). Longer-lived magma systems (up to several Ma) can be much more diverse in magma composition and morphology (Klemetti and Grunder, 2008) or represented by monotonous dacite dome complexes with compositions similar to parts of the old cone of Parinacota (e.g. Taapaca, Clavero et al., 2004). Our data from Parinacota illustrate how changes from one magmatic regime to the other take place, how fast such transitions may be, and what their textural, chemical, and isotopic consequences are.

We show that a ‘dirty’ to ‘clean’ transition is a viable mechanism for generating differentiation trends that straddle the calc-alkaline vs. tholeiitic compositional boundary. Elevated LREE/HREE and large Th-excess in the most tholeiitic samples suggest both are controlled by garnet-residual processes in the lower crust whereas upper-crustal assimilation exerts significant control on melt FeO*/MgO. Apparent calc-alkaline or tholeiitic affinity at Parinacota is apparently due to mixing among magmas sourced in the upper- and lower-crust, respectively. Transit times are constrained by $(^{230}$U$/^{232}$Th) disequilibria to be shortest for the least calc-alkaline samples, indicating that the deep crustal signature had been preserved. Long upper-crustal stagnation times, evinced by near-equiine, upper-crustal $(^{230}$Th$/^{232}$Th) are correlated with the most contaminated, calc-alkaline samples. Arc magmas traverse thick continental crust at variable speeds, dependent largely on throughput and whether shallow stagnation occurs in sub-volcanic systems. Our results illustrate the importance of shallow processes in modifying or damping deep crustal heterogeneities in parent magma compositions. A significant
amount of the chemical and isotopic variability observed in these settings may therefore depend on the degree to which shallow and deep processes have affected magma composition.

Acknowledgements

We thank Jorge Claervo for sharing his knowledge and previous mapping that facilitated fieldwork at Parinacota as well as Carlos Nassar and CONAF for permission to work and sample in Parque Nacional Lauca. This work was supported by U.S. National Science Foundation (NSF) grants EAR-0337667, EAR-0516760, and EAR-0738007 to Singer, Geological Society of America (GSA) and Sigma Xi grants to Hora, and German Science Foundation grants Wo362/18 and Wo236/20 to Wörner. We would thank editor Richard Carlson for efficient handling of this submission, and Mary Reid and an anonymous reviewer for thoughtful comments that greatly improved this manuscript.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data associated with this article can be found in the online version, at doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2009.05.042.

References


